

**MINUTES OF HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD  
REGULAR MEETING OF THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 1, 2005  
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL  
2263 SANTA CLARA AVENUE – 7:00 PM**

Vice-Chair Miller called the meeting to order at 7:02 pm. Secretary Eliason called the roll.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Vice-Chair Miller, Board Members Lynch & Tilos.

MEMBERS ABSENT: Chair Anderson.

STAFF PRESENT: Secretary Eliason, Emily Pudell, Planner II, Dennis Brighton, Planner II, Recording Secretary, Debbie Gremminger.

MINUTES:

Minutes of the Regular Meeting of June 2, 2005. (*continued from the 8-4-05 mtg.*)

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to approve the minutes of the Regular meeting of June 2, 2005. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

Minutes of the Regular Meeting of July 7, 2005. (*continued from the 8-4-05 mtg.*)

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to approve the minutes of the Regular meeting of July 7, 2005. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

Minutes of the Regular Meeting of August 4, 2005.

A quorum to consider these minutes was not present. They will be considered at the next meeting.

AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSIONS:

None.

**ACTION ITEMS:** (Discussion/Action)

1. Appointment of a Historical Advisory Board member to the Transportation Subcommittee.

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to continue this item until there is a full board. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

2. Certificate of Approval CA05-0024 – Applicant: Mark Haskett – 1715 Encinal Avenue. (DB). The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Approval for demolition of more than thirty percent (30%) of a residential structure built prior to 1942, located at the above address, for the purposes of remodeling the existing single-family dwelling. The site is located within an R-4, Neighborhood Residential Zoning District.

Mr. Brighton presented staff report. He informed the Board that this structure is not listed on the Historical Building Study List, but was built prior to 1942, so a Certificate of Approval for demolition is required. The building consisted of several different architectural styles and had been severely altered over the years. None of the alterations appear to have improved the architectural characteristics of the structure.

Mr. Brighton also stated that on February 23, 2005, the applicant had received Major Design Review approval. This application received extensive coordination with members of AAPS throughout the review process including a public meeting with the architect, neighbors, members of AAPS, and City Staff. Plans were submitted to the Planning and Building Department that incorporated the requested design alterations from the January 11, 2005 public meeting.

Mr. Brighton concluded by stating that the structure did not represent the work of a master or possesses high artistic values. There are no events or persons of historical interest associated with the property. Therefore, staff recommends the Board approve the Certificate of Approval with conditions stated in draft Resolution.

In response to a question from Board Member Tilos, Ms. Eliason stated that since this is a pre-1942 structure, that is not on the study list, the Board can either approve the Certificate of Approval, so the applicant can move forward with project, or they can deny the Certificate of Approval, and applicant will have to pay a fine and the investigative fees for doing work without proper permits.

Vice-Chair Miller opened the public hearing.

Joanne Gibson, Ellen Gomez, Ruth Tillman and Rosemary McNally spoke against this Certificate of Approval.

Bill Smith spoke about the demolition process and the fact that the public is unaware of the penalties stated in the Ordinance.

Peter McDonald spoke on behalf on applicant. He informed the Board that the applicant was unaware of the requirement for a Certificate of Approval. He informed the Board of the steps the Hasketts went through to obtain the permit.

Dave Teeters, architect, spoke in favor of approving the Certificate of Approval. He reviewed the pictures of 1715 Encinal Ave, which were provided to the Board in their packet.

There were no more speaker slips. Vice-Chair Miller closed the public hearing and opened the floor to board discussion.

Board Member Lynch stated that the entire process should be amended. She would like to deny this Certificate of Approval so it will get up to City Council level. She also stated her concerns with the staff report regarding maintaining the historical integrity of the building.

Board Member Tilos is in favor of approving the Certificate of Approval. Currently, there are too many requirements involved with getting an approval.

Vice-Chair Miller stated that the applicant should have had the proper permits prior to demolishing the structure.

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to approve Certificate of Approval CA05-0024, for the partial demolition of an existing residence at 1715 Encinal Avenue as stated in draft Resolution. 1-2-1.

Ayes: 1; Noes: 2; Absent: 1; Motion is denied.

**3. CA05-0018, 812 Paru Street, Applicant: John Miller/Kathleen Egan (EP).** The applicants request a Certificate of Approval to remove a Coast Live Oak tree (*Quercus Agrifolia*) located at the rear of the property. The tree is greater than 24" in diameter and is only 5' from the main building. Per an Arborist, the tree is in poor health and has structural flaws. The site is located at 812 Paru Street, within an R-1, One Family Residence Zoning District.

Ms. Pudell presented staff report. The applicant is requesting removal of an Oak Tree to eliminate the potential damage the tree may cause to the site and neighboring properties. An arborist report was submitted which states the tree should be removed at the earliest possible date due to its close proximity to the property owners home, its failing health, and structural flaws. Staff recommends that the Board approve the Certificate of Approval with conditions as stated in draft Resolution.

There were no speaker slips for this item. Vice-Chair Miller opened the floor for Board discussion.

Minutes of September 1, 2005  
Regular Historical Advisory Board Meeting

Board Member Lynch feels that tree is in poor health and should be removed.

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to approve the Certificate of Approval CA05-0018, for the removal of one Coast Live Oak tree at 812 Paru Street with conditions stated in draft Resolution. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

**4. CA05-0020, 1415 Union Street, Applicant: Julie Cowell (EP).** The applicant requests a Certificate of Approval for the removal of a Coast Live Oak tree (*Quercus Agrifolia*) that was located along the left side of the driveway. The tree was promoting hazardous conditions due to its proximity to the eaves of the building. The site is located at 1415 Union Street, within an R-5, General Residential Zoning District.

Ms. Pudell presented staff report. The tree was removed in July 2005 because it posed a health and safety hazard to the apartment building located on the property. A six foot tall portion of the stump still remains. Typically staff would require two replacement trees be planted, but a landscape plan was submitted by the applicant indicating that there does not appear to be a suitable location for the replacement trees. Staff is requesting that the applicant pay fees equal to the cost of the two replacement trees to be collected by the Recreation and Parks Department.

There were no speaker slips submitted for this item. Vice-Chair Miller opened the floor to Board discussion.

Vice-Chair Miller is in favor of approval, but would like staff to notify the Board when the fees are collected.

Board Member Tilos feels there should be a penalty for removing an oak tree without proper approval.

Ms. Eliason informed the Board that Staff is currently working on revisions to the Historical Preservation Ordinance and can include a section on penalties for removing Oak trees without a permit. As it is now, the only way to impose penalties would be if the application came in as a code enforcement complaint, then investigative fees would apply.

M/S (Tilos, Lynch) to approve Certificate of Approval CA05-0020 for the removal of one Coast Live Oak Tree at 1415 Union Street with conditions as stated in draft Resolution.. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1. Motion carries.

**5. CA05-0021, 1705 Eagle Avenue, Applicant: Gregory & Anna Sanford (EP).** The applicant requests a Certificate of Approval for the removal of a Coast Live Oak tree (*Quercus Agrifolia*) that was located on the property. The tree was promoting hazardous conditions due to its proximity to utility wires and the roof of the building at 1705 Eagle Avenue. The site is located at 1705 Eagle Avenue, within an R-2, Two Family Residence Zoning District.

Ms. Pudell presented staff report. A large Coast Live Oak tree that was located between the property line and the back of the sidewalk in front of 1707 Eagle Avenue was removed in late July 2005. According to the applicant, the tree posed a hazard to the house and the utility lines. It is unclear whether the applicant knew the tree was located on City property. Given that this tree was not removed from the applicant's property, staff is recommending that fees, equal to the cost of two replacement trees be collected from the Recreation and Parks Department. Staff recommends approval of CA05-0021, with conditions as stated in draft Resolution.

Vice-Chair Miller opened the public hearing.

John Miller, 812 Paru St., stated that the current Ordinance should be rewritten. There should be penalties imposed when an Oak tree is removed without a permit.

Greg Sanford, applicant, informed the Board that he did have permission from the adjacent property owner. He was not aware that Oak trees were protected.

Vice-Chair Miller closed the public hearing.

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to approve the Certificate of Approval CA05-0021, for the removal of one Coast Live Oak tree at 1707 Eagle Ave with conditions as stated in draft Resolution. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

**6. CA05-0022 and CA05-0023, 818 and 1706 Lincoln Avenue, Applicant: City of Alameda (EP).** Review proposal to designate two signs as historical signs. The signs, completed in 1891, were cast into the concrete to mark the locations of the train station waiting rooms. These sites are located in the sidewalk in front of 818 and 1706 Lincoln Avenue within the R-4 and C-1 (Neighborhood Residential and Neighborhood Business) Districts.

Ms. Pudell reviewed staff report. This item is being brought to the Board at the request of Board Member Lynch at the July 7, 2005 meeting. Staff is asking the Board to review the Historical Sign checklist and evaluate each sign for inclusion on the Historic Sign List.

The Board evaluated each sign and found that both signs at 818 & 1706 Lincoln Avenue were eligible for placement on the List.

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to approve Certificate of Approval CA05-0022, for the designation of two Historic Train Station Waiting Room signs at 818 and 1706 Lincoln Avenue as stated in draft resolution. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

REPORTS:

7. Replacement of Historic Entrance Lights at the Posey Tube.

Ms. Pudell presented staff report. Staff is asking that the Board review the photographs and specifications, and give their comments. Staff will forward the comments to the Public Works Department.

Vice-Chair Miller opened the public hearing.

Richard Rutter & Chris Buckley spoke in favor of restoring the lights to look like the original fixtures.

Vice-Chair Miller closed the public hearing and opened the floor to Board discussion.

The Board submitted the following comments to staff:

1. Caltrans should restore the lights to the original style.
2. Caltrans should investigate recasting as an economic option. One suggested company was the "Spring Company".
3. Caltrans should consider to piggyback with other communities such as San Leandro and Oakland on replacement lighting.
4. The new lights should be adequate to meet lighting needs.
5. The cobra heads should be removed.
6. HAB requested to see the final design.

Ms. Eliason stated that this is a Caltrans project, but staff will request them to return the final design to the HAB for final approval.

Staff noted the Board's comments and will forward them to the Public Works Department.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: (Discussion only)

Ms. Eliason noted an Off-Agenda report and Resolution approving handicapped ramp addition to 351 Corpus Christi Road, Alameda Point.

**STAFF COMMUNICATION:**

Ms. Eliason informed the Board that the City Council will hear the appeal of 616 Pacific on September 6, 2005.

Ms. Eliason informed the Board that all pre-1942 plans submitted to the Planning & Building Department will be stamped in big red letters that says:

**NOTE:**

**BUILDINGS CONSTRUCTED PRIOR TO 1942 SHALL NOT HAVE MORE THAN 30% OF THE VALUE OF THE BUILDINGS REMOVED OR DEMOLISHED WITHOUT FIRST OBTAINING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL FROM THE CITY OF ALAMEDA'S HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD.**

Staff feels that this should help control any future unauthorized demolitions.

Ms. Pudell informed the Board that staff has not received an application for 500 Central Ave. She has been in contact with the applicant and hopes to have something for the October meeting.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to adjourn meeting at 8:58 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by:

---

Cynthia Eliason,  
Secretary, Historical Advisory Board

G:\PLANNING\HAB\AGENMIN\Agemin.05\8-4-05 HAB minutes.doc